

1 SUE ELLEN WOOLDRIDGE
Assistant Attorney General
2 Environment & Natural Resources Division
United States Department of Justice
3 BRADLEY R. O'BRIEN - State Bar No. 189425
Environmental Enforcement Section
4 Environment and Natural Resources Division
United States Department of Justice
5 301 Howard Street, Suite 1050
San Francisco, California 94105
6 Telephone: (415) 744-6484
Facsimile: (415) 744-6476

7 CAROL C. LAM
United States Attorney
8 San Diego County Office - Federal Office Building
880 Front Street, Room 6293
9 San Diego, California 92101
Telephone: (619) 557-5610
10 Facsimile: (619) 557-5782

11 Attorneys for Plaintiff United States of America

12 Additional Counsel Listed on Next Page
13

14 **IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
15

16 UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,)	
)	
17 Plaintiff,)	CIV. NO. 03-CV-1349K (POR)
)	
18 v.)	SECOND PARTIAL CONSENT DECREE
)	
19 CITY OF SAN DIEGO,)	
)	
20 Defendant.)	

21 SAN DIEGO BAYKEEPER, <u>et al.</u> ,)	
)	
22 Plaintiffs,)	CIV. NO. 01-CV-0550B (POR)
)	
23 v.)	
)	
24 CITY OF SAN DIEGO,)	
)	
25 Defendant.)	

1 MARCO A. GONZALEZ
RORY R. WICKS
2 Coast Law Group, LLP
169 Saxony Road, Suite 204
3 Encinitas, California 92024
Telephone: (760)942-8505 ext. 102
4 Facsimile: (760)942-8515

5 DANIEL COOPER
Lawyers for Clean Water
6 1004 A O'Reilly Avenue
San Francisco, California 94129
7 Telephone: (415)561-2222
Facsimile: (415)561-2223

8 Attorneys for Plaintiff Surfrider Foundation and San Diego Baykeeper

9 MICHAEL J. AGUIRRE
City Attorney
10 THOMAS C. ZELENY
Deputy City Attorney
11 Office of the San Diego City Attorney
12 1200 3rd Avenue, Suite 1100
San Diego, California 92101
13 Telephone: (619) 533-5800
Facsimile: (619) 533- 5856

14 Attorneys for Defendant City of San Diego
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1		
2	I.	JURISDICTION - 3 -
3	II.	VENUE - 3 -
4	III.	PARTIES - 4 -
5	IV.	DEFINITIONS - 4 -
6	V.	OBJECTIVES - 7 -
7	VI.	BINDING EFFECT - 7 -
8	VII.	COMPLIANCE ACTIONS - 8 -
9	VIII.	PLAN AND REPORT REVIEW AND APPROVAL - 29 -
10	IX.	DISPUTE RESOLUTION - 32 -
11	X.	FORCE MAJEURE - 35 -
12	XI.	STIPULATED PENALTIES - 37 -
13	XII.	PAYMENTS - 41 -
14	XIII.	RIGHT OF ENTRY - 41 -
15	XIV.	NOT A PERMIT - 42 -
16	XV.	ONGOING COMPLIANCE RESPONSIBILITIES - 42 -
17	XVI.	EFFECT OF SETTLEMENT - 42 -
18	XVII.	RESERVATION BY BAYKEEPER AND SURFRIDER - 44 -
19	XVIII.	NO ADMISSION OF LIABILITY - 44 -
20	XIX.	CERTIFICATION OF SUBMISSIONS/RECORD RETENTION - 44 -
21	XX.	FORM OF NOTICE - 45 -
22	XXI.	COSTS OF SUIT/COMPLIANCE MONITORING - 47 -
23	XXII.	MODIFICATION - 48 -
24	XXIII.	CONTINUING JURISDICTION OF THE COURT - 48 -
25	XXIV.	TERMINATION - 49 -
26	XXV.	SIGNATORIES - 49 -

1 XXVI. COUNTERPARTS - 50 -

2 XXVII. PUBLIC COMMENT - 50 -

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

1 **WHEREAS**, Plaintiff, the United States of America ("United States"), by the authority
2 of the Attorney General of the United States and through its undersigned counsel, acting at the
3 request and on behalf of the Administrator of the United States Environmental Protection
4 Agency ("EPA"), filed a Complaint on July 9, 2003, seeking injunctive relief and civil penalties
5 pursuant to Section 309 of the Federal Water Pollution Control Act, as amended by the Clean
6 Water Act of 1977 and the Water Quality Act of 1987 ("CWA" or "Act"), 33 U.S.C. § 1319,
7 naming as defendant the City of San Diego, California ("the City");

8 **WHEREAS**, the State of California, ("the State") ex rel. the Regional Water Quality
9 Control Board, San Diego Region, ("the Regional Board") filed a Complaint on July 11, 2003,
10 seeking injunctive relief pursuant to Section 309 of the CWA, 33 U.S.C. § 1319, naming as
11 defendant the City;

12 **WHEREAS**, Plaintiffs San Diego Baykeeper ("Baykeeper") and the Surfrider
13 Foundation ("Surfrider") (herein collectively "Citizen Plaintiffs") served the City; the United
14 States Attorney General; EPA; the State Water Resources Control Board; and the Regional
15 Board, with a notice of intent to file suit ("60-Day Notice") under Sections 505(a) and (b) of the
16 CWA, 33 U.S.C. § 1365(a) and (b) on October 30, 2000, alleging that the City had in the past
17 and continues to violate Section 301(a) of the CWA, 33 U.S.C. § 1311(a), by violating the City's
18 Sanitary and Storm Water Permits;

19 **WHEREAS**, on March 29, 2001, Baykeeper and Surfrider filed a Complaint against the
20 City;

21 **WHEREAS**, the City owns and operates a publicly-owned wastewater collection and
22 treatment system that is regulated by identical 2002 permits issued by EPA under the CWA and
23 the Regional Board under the California Porter-Cologne Water Quality Control Act,
24 respectively, NPDES permit CA0107409 (September 13, 2002), Order Number R-9-2002-0025
25 (April 10, 2002) and Order Number 2002-0013 (August 15, 2002)("the permit");

1 **WHEREAS**, the Plaintiffs allege that the City has violated and continues to violate the
2 CWA as a result of sanitary sewer overflows ("SSOs") from its publicly-owned treatment
3 system;

4 **WHEREAS**, EPA issued a Finding of Violation and Order pursuant to Sections 308(a)
5 and 309(a) of the CWA on April 5, 2002, setting forth a comprehensive set of requirements to be
6 met by the City to reduce and eliminate sewage spills;

7 **WHEREAS**, the City contends that it has upgraded the operation and maintenance of its
8 wastewater collection and treatment system to reduce unpermitted overflows and that its
9 operation and maintenance program meets or exceeds all applicable federal and state regulations;

10 **WHEREAS**, the Mayor and Members of the City Council created a formal Citizen's
11 Clean Water Task Force to reduce SSOs and passed Resolution No. R-295587 on October 16,
12 2001, which raised sewer service rates 7.5% for each of the Fiscal Years 2002-2005 and
13 dedicated a specific portion of those increases exclusively to sewer pipe replacement and
14 rehabilitation;

15 **WHEREAS**, the City contends that since calendar year 2000 the City has reduced
16 wastewater overflows;

17 **WHEREAS**, the City paid penalties of \$6,258,900 to the Regional Board from 2000 to
18 2005 for sewage spills occurring prior to October 1, 2004 (\$2,115,500 in cash and \$4,143,400 in
19 supplemental environmental projects);

20 **WHEREAS**, the parties agree that the City must pursue short and long term
21 infrastructure improvements and upgrades designed to reduce municipal sanitary sewer
22 overflows;

23 **WHEREAS**, the parties previously entered into a Partial Consent Decree to immediately
24 implement short-term capital improvement projects and operation and maintenance
25 requirements, which expires on June 30, 2006;

26 **WHEREAS**, the City has substantially complied with the operations and maintenance
27
28

1 requirements of the Partial Consent Decree.

2 **WHEREAS**, the parties agree that entry of this Partial Consent Decree ("Second Partial
3 Consent Decree") is an appropriate way to continue implementation of the short-term capital
4 improvement projects and the operation and maintenance and other requirements in Section VII
5 (Compliance Actions) Paragraphs B - D of this Second Partial Consent Decree;

6 **WHEREAS**, the United States, Citizen Plaintiffs, and the City (collectively referred to
7 herein as the "Settling Parties" or "Parties") agree that it is in the public interest to enter into this
8 Second Partial Consent Decree;

9 **WHEREAS**, the Court finds that this Second Partial Consent Decree is a reasonable and
10 fair and partial settlement and that it adequately protects the public interest in accordance with
11 the CWA.

12 **WHEREAS**, the parties intend to lodge a Final Consent Decree no later than June 30,
13 2007, addressing the long-term operation and maintenance requirements and capital
14 improvement projects relating to the City's Collection System; and

15 **NOW THEREFORE**, it is hereby ORDERED, ADJUDGED, and DECREED as
16 follows:

17 **I. JURISDICTION**

18 This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of the claims asserted by the United
19 States pursuant to Section 309(b) of the CWA, 33 U.S.C. § 1319(b) and 28 U.S.C. § 1331. This
20 Court has jurisdiction over the claims brought by the Baykeeper and Surfrider pursuant to
21 Section 505(a) of the CWA, 33 U.S.C. § 1365(a), and 28 U.S.C. § 1331.

22 **II. VENUE**

23 Venue is proper in the United States District Court for the Southern District of California
24 pursuant to Sections 309(b) and 505(c) of the CWA, 33 U.S.C. §§ 1319(b) and 1365(c), and
25 28 U.S.C. §§ 1391(b), because it is the judicial district in which the alleged violations occurred.

1 **III. PARTIES**

2 A. Baykeeper is a nonprofit public benefit corporation organized under the laws of
3 the State of California, with its principal place of business in San Diego, California. Baykeeper
4 is a membership organization that is dedicated to the preservation and enjoyment of the oceans,
5 waves, and beaches. Its members currently use and enjoy the ocean and beaches of San Diego
6 County for a variety of recreational, esthetic, economic, and other purposes. Baykeeper brought
7 this action on behalf of itself and its members.

8 B. Surfrider is a nonprofit public benefit corporation organized under the laws of the
9 State of California, with its principal place of business in San Clemente, California. Surfrider is
10 a membership organization that is dedicated to the preservation and enjoyment of the oceans,
11 waves, and beaches. Its members currently use and enjoy the ocean and beaches of San Diego
12 County for a variety of recreational, esthetic, economic, and other purposes. Surfrider brought
13 this action on behalf of itself and its members.

14 C. The United States appears on behalf of EPA, a federal agency with responsibility
15 for enforcing the CWA.

16 D. The City is a California municipal corporation and possesses NPDES Permit No.
17 CA0107409 to discharge treated effluent from the Point Loma Metropolitan Wastewater
18 Treatment Plant. The City owns and operates a publicly owned treatment works as defined in
19 33 U.S.C. § 1292 and 40 C.F.R. § 403.3.

20 **IV. DEFINITIONS**

21 Unless otherwise defined herein, terms used in this Second Partial Consent Decree shall
22 have the meaning given to those terms in the CWA, 33 U.S.C. §§ 1251-1387, and the regulations
23 promulgated thereunder. For the purposes of this Second Partial Consent Decree, the following
24 terms shall have the meaning provided below:

25 "Acute Defect" means a defect that substantially increases the probability of a material
26 SSO, and includes conditions leading to imminent structural collapse or that would create

1 repeated blockages.

2 "Administrative Order" means the Finding of Violation and Order, Docket No.
3 CWA-309-9-02-17 that EPA issued to the City on April 5, 2002, pursuant to Sections 308(a) and
4 309(a) of the CWA, which was withdrawn by the EPA upon entry of the previous Partial
5 Consent Decree on September 13, 2005.

6 "Canyon Economic and Environmental Analysis" means an analysis of the feasibility of
7 relocating sewer lines out of each canyon.

8 "Capital Improvement Program" ("CIP") means the City's ten (10) year "rolling" sewer
9 repair, rehabilitation and replacement planning document.

10 "Collection System" means all pipes, manholes, sewer lines, pump stations, and
11 appurtenances thereto under ownership of the City that are intended to convey domestic or
12 industrial wastewater to the City's wastewater treatment plants.

13 "Contractor" as used in this Second Partial Consent Decree, means the City's
14 contractor(s) and subcontractor(s), agents, assigns, successors, and duly authorized
15 representatives of City contractors.

16 "Director" means the Director of the EPA Region 9 Water Division.

17 "Final Consent Decree" means a consent decree entered into by the United States and the
18 City that extends until at least 2013 and requires the City to perform long-term operation and
19 maintenance requirements and complete capital improvement projects relating to the City's
20 Collection System; and

21 "Lamping" means an inspection method in which a light source is put into a manhole and
22 a visual device, such as a mirror, is placed in an adjacent manhole to try to detect blockages in
23 the pipe.

24 "Large Diameter Pipes" means pipes in the City of San Diego's wastewater collection
25 system that are greater than fifteen (15) inches in diameter.

26 "Plan for Accelerated Cleaning Program" means the plan the City submitted to EPA on
27
28

1 September 27, 2002.

2 "Plan for Root Control Program" means the plan the City submitted to EPA on
3 September 27, 2002.

4 "Plan for Sewer Overflow Response and Tracking" means the plan the City submitted to
5 EPA dated October, 2003.

6 "Plan for Sewer Pipe Inspection and Condition Assessment" means the plan the City
7 submitted to EPA on September 27, 2002.

8 "Plan for Sewer Repair, Rehabilitation, and Replacement" means the plan the City
9 submitted to EPA on September 27, 2002.

10 "Plan for Fats, Oils & Grease ("FOG") Blockage Control" means the plan the City
11 submitted to EPA on September 27, 2002.

12 "Plan for Canyon Area Spill Elimination" means the plan the City submitted to EPA on
13 September 27, 2002.

14 "Plan for Pump Station and Force Main Spill Reduction Action" means the plan the City
15 submitted to EPA on September 27, 2002.

16 "Plan to Address Other Sanitary Sewer Overflows" means the plan the City submitted to
17 EPA on September 27, 2002.

18 "Plan for Capacity Assurance" means the plan the City submitted to EPA on September
19 27, 2002.

20 "Plan for System-wide Cleaning Program" means the plan the City submitted to EPA on
21 January 29, 2004.

22 "Sanitary Sewer Backup" or "SSB" is a wastewater backup into a building or solely onto
23 private property from a private lateral that is caused by a blockage or other malfunction in the
24 Collection System.

25 "Sanitary Sewer Overflow" or "SSO" means an overflow, spill, or release of wastewater
26 from the Collection System at any point upstream of the sewage treatment plant. For purposes of
27

1 this Second Partial Consent Decree only, an SSB is an SSO.

2 "Second Partial Consent Decree" means this consent decree.

3 "Section" shall mean the sections denoted by a roman numeral.

4 "Small Diameter Pipes" means pipes in the City of San Diego wastewater collection
5 system that are less than or equal to fifteen (15) inches in diameter.

6 "United States" shall mean the United States of America.

7 **V. OBJECTIVES**

8 A. In entering into this Second Partial Consent Decree, the Parties intend to further
9 the objectives set forth in Section 101 of the CWA, 33 U.S.C. § 1251, and to achieve expeditious
10 compliance with this Second Partial Consent Decree for such purposes as eliminating spills to
11 the extent feasible.

12 **VI. BINDING EFFECT**

13 A. The provisions of this Second Partial Consent Decree shall apply to, and be
14 binding upon the City, United States, EPA, Baykeeper, and Surfrider and their successors and
15 assigns.

16 B. The City shall give written notice, and provide a copy of this Second Partial
17 Consent Decree to any person or entity to whom the City may transfer ownership or operation of
18 its publicly owned treatment works, including any portion of the Collection System. The City
19 shall notify the United States and EPA in writing of any successor in interest at least forty-five
20 (45) days prior to any such transfer.

21 C. The City shall provide a copy of this Second Partial Consent Decree, or otherwise
22 make it available to:

23 1. each engineering, consulting, and contracting firm to be retained to
24 perform any material activities required by this Second Partial Consent Decree upon execution
25 of any contract relating to such work; and

26 2. each engineering, consulting, and contracting firm already retained for

1 such purpose.

2 D. In an action to enforce this Second Partial Consent Decree, the City shall not
3 assert as a defense against the Plaintiffs that any of its officers, directors, employees, agents,
4 servants, Contractors, successors or assigns are responsible for the City's failure to perform
5 under this Second Partial Consent Decree.

6 **VII. COMPLIANCE ACTIONS**

7 A. The City has completed the plans listed below for the operation and maintenance
8 of its Collection System. The City shall use best efforts to implement the plans identified below
9 for the operation and maintenance of the Collection System. The City may subsequently modify
10 these Paragraph A plans to incorporate new information and to make maintenance of the
11 collection system more efficient or to make other changes that the City deems appropriate that
12 are not inconsistent with the objectives of this Second Partial Consent Decree. The City's
13 obligation to implement these Paragraph A plans shall not be subject to enforcement under this
14 Second Partial Consent Decree.

- 15 1. Plan for Sewer Overflow Response and Tracking;
- 16 2. Plan for System-wide Cleaning Program;
- 17 3. Plan for Accelerated Cleaning;
- 18 4. Plan for Root Control Program;
- 19 5. Plan for Sewer Pipe Inspection and Condition Assessment;
- 20 6. Plan for Sewer Repair, Rehabilitation and Replacement;
- 21 7. Plan for Fats, Oils & Grease ("FOG") Blockage Control;
- 22 8. Plan for Canyon Area Spill Elimination;
- 23 9. Plan for Pump Station and Force Main Spill Reduction Action;
- 24 10. Plan to Address Other Sanitary Sewer Overflows; and
- 25 11. Plan for Capacity Assurance.

26 The City shall implement and meet the specific requirements of Paragraphs B - H below.

1 In the event of a conflict between the requirements in Paragraphs B - H below and the Paragraph
2 A plans listed above, the requirements in Paragraphs B - H below shall supercede the listed
3 plans.

4 B. SSO RESPONSE AND TRACKING

5 1. In addition to the information required to be reported pursuant to
6 Regional Board Order WDR 96-04, the City's NPDES permit, and any other applicable local,
7 state or federal requirement, the City's Quarterly SSO reports required under Section VII
8 (Compliance Actions) Paragraph H of this Second Partial Consent Decree shall include at a
9 minimum:

- 10 a. the name of the trunk sewer (for SSOs relating to trunk sewers);
- 11 b. the name of the canyon (for SSOs relating to canyons);
- 12 c. the total SSO volume (excluding SSBs), the volume returned to
13 the system, and the volume not captured; and
- 14 d. the total SSB volume.

15 2. The City shall have crews on duty and available for response to SSOs
16 twenty-four (24) hours per day every day of the year with the exception of the ten (10) holidays
17 designated by the City. On each of the ten (10) holidays, the City shall have a duty supervisor
18 on call who is able to immediately mobilize response crews. The City shall make all reasonable
19 efforts to respond to a SSO within thirty (30) minutes of notification.

20 3. For any SSB about which a private customer contacts the City for
21 assistance or the City otherwise responds to, if either a licensed plumber or the City concludes
22 that an SSB has occurred, the City must follow the same response procedures as it follows for
23 other SSOs.

24 4. The City shall maintain a SSO response log including response times. The
25 City may maintain a separate log for SSBs.

26 5. The City shall operate and maintain a flow metering alarm system that

1 covers at least ninety percent (90%) of the flow weighted length of the City's three hundred forty
2 (340) miles of trunk sewers, including all canyon trunk sewers. The system must be capable of
3 detecting and notifying City staff within ninety (90) minutes of reductions in flow of twenty-five
4 percent (25%) or more of the average dry weather flow during dry weather conditions.

5 C. CONTROL OF NON-CAPACITY RELATED SSOS

6 1. SYSTEM-WIDE GRAVITY COLLECTION SYSTEM CLEANING
7 PROGRAM

8 a. By March 31, 2004, with the exception noted below, the City
9 shall complete at least one (1) cleaning of each sewer pipe in the City's two thousand eight
10 hundred nineteen (2,819) mile gravity municipal collection system. However, the City may
11 decide not to clean up to thirty (30) miles of pipe located in environmentally sensitive areas
12 and/or in non-right-of-way areas if the CCTV inspection demonstrates the pipe is clear, or for
13 which permits cannot be obtained by the City to allow for the cleaning prior to March 31, 2004.
14 The City will make all reasonable efforts to obtain such permits in a timely manner. In the event
15 the CCTV inspection demonstrates that the pipe requires cleaning, the City shall continue with
16 the permitting process for sewer pipe cleaning and complete the required cleaning activities
17 within six (6) months of completing the cleaning permit process.

18 b. Starting April 1, 2004, the City shall clean each sewer pipe in the
19 City's two thousand five hundred thirty-eight (2,538) mile small diameter gravity collection
20 system on a minimum five (5) year frequency. For each five (5) year cleaning cycle, the City
21 may elect to exclude from cleaning up to thirty (30) miles in environmentally sensitive non-right
22 of way areas if the CCTV inspection demonstrates the pipe is clear. Starting April 1, 2004, the
23 City shall clean each sewer pipe in the City's two hundred eighty-one (281) mile large diameter
24 gravity system on a minimum five (5) year frequency unless the City can demonstrate the pipe is
25 adequately clean through a cleaning needs assessment consisting of CCTV and hydraulic
26 investigation, manhole inspection, and/or personnel entry into the sewer pipe. All miles cleaned
27
28

1 under this Paragraph may be included in the one thousand five hundred (1,500) miles of annual
2 cleaning required in Section VII (Compliance Actions) Paragraph C 2a.

3 c. By March 1st of each calendar year and pursuant to Section VII
4 (Compliance Actions) Paragraph G of this Second Partial Consent Decree, the City shall submit
5 an annual report to EPA for review pursuant to Section VIII (Plan and Report Review and
6 Approval) that documents which sewers and how many miles of pipe were cleaned as part of the
7 system-wide cleaning program during the previous calendar year. The report shall distinguish
8 between sewer pipes in canyon and non-canyon areas. The annual report shall describe the
9 status of any pipes included in the thirty (30) miles described in Paragraphs a. and b. above,
10 specify which miles were included in the thirty (30) miles, and explain the basis for not cleaning
11 any Large Diameter Pipes.

12 2. ACCELERATED PREVENTIVE MAINTENANCE (ACCELERATED
13 PM) CLEANING PROGRAM

14 a. The City shall clean a minimum of one thousand five-hundred
15 (1,500) miles of pipe per year. Calculation of the 1,500 miles may include problem pipe
16 segments that are cleaned more frequently than annually.

17 b. To make changes to the cleaning frequency of its pipes, the City
18 shall use a cleaning algorithm based upon SSO history and the pipe conditions observed in the
19 field. The City shall use the following "condition findings" in its algorithm used to adjust pipe
20 cleaning frequencies:

21 c. **CONDITION FINDINGS:**

Clear	Light	Medium	Heavy
No observable grease, roots, or sludge	1.0 to 1.5 gallons of sludge, small chunks of grease, slight detection of root mass, 20 to 30 minutes to clean a line, 1 to 2 passes to clear the water.	2 to 3 gallons of sludge, moderate chunks of grease, observable root mass, 30 minutes to clean a line, 2 to 3 passes to clear the water.	4 or more gallons of sludge, grease, clumps of roots, more than 30 minutes to clean, more than 4 passes to clear the water.

26 Note: A "line" is a pipe segment of approximately 300 feet length between two manholes.

d. Based on one of the methods below, the City may determine whether to increase or decrease the pipe cleaning frequency changes.

(i) Method 1: Software Algorithm Recommendations

Cleaning Frequency Decreases:		
Category	Findings	Frequency Step Change
1 to 6 Month:	Clear for three consecutive cleaning cycles	A One-Step Frequency Decrease to a time interval of 3, 6, or 12 months.
12 to 24 Month:	Clear for two consecutive cleaning cycles	A One-Step Frequency Decrease to a time interval of 24 or 60 months.
60 Month:	N/A	Small diameter pipes on a 60 month schedule will never be cleaned less frequently. Large Diameter pipes may skip cleaning if a physical inspection per Section VII (Compliance Actions) Paragraph C 1b., determines that the pipe is clear.
Cleaning Frequency Increases:		
Category	Findings	Frequency Step Change
1 to 6 Month:	Findings of either 1 Medium Or 1 Heavy during any cleaning cycle	A One-Step Frequency Increase to a time interval of 1 or 3 months. An existing 1 month time interval will not be reduced but will be transferred for further consideration under Method 2: Crew/ Supervisor Recommendations.
12 to 24 Month:	Findings of either 2 Medium Or 1 Heavy during any cleaning cycle	A One-Step Frequency Increase to a time interval of 6 or 12 months.
60 Month:	Findings of either 1 Medium Or 1 Heavy during any cleaning cycle	A One-Step Frequency Increase to a time interval of 24 months.
Note: All Findings Depict Pipes that have been cleaned within +/-25% of their current frequency's scheduled cleaning date.		

(ii) Method 2: Crew/ Supervisor Recommendations

Changes to cleaning frequencies for pipes that recently have been repaired, rehabilitated,

1 or replaced shall be made in Regular Sanitary Sewer Overflow Report Tracking ("SSORT") or
2 other appropriate meetings held by City staff. Corrective actions and appropriate frequency
3 adjustments shall be made based upon SSO/ blockage relief cleaning findings, historical cleaning
4 data, and if available, CCTV data.
5

6 e. By March 1st of each year, and pursuant to Section VII
7 (Compliance Actions) Paragraph G of this Second Partial Consent Decree, the City shall submit
8 an annual report to EPA for review pursuant to Section VIII (Plan and Report Review and
9 Approval) that: (i) documents which sewers and how many miles of pipe were cleaned as part of
10 the Accelerated PM cleaning program during the previous calendar year; (ii) includes a table
11 containing the number of miles of sewer pipes within each cleaning frequency and the number of
12 miles identified for the Repair, Rehabilitation, and Replacement Program; (iii) describes the
13 success of the program at preventing repeat blockages and sewage overflows from pipes
14 included in the Accelerated PM cleaning program; and (iv) distinguishes between pipes in
15 canyons and pipes located elsewhere.
16
17

18 3. ROOT CONTROL PROGRAM

19 a. The City shall utilize mechanical root control to clean at least three
20 hundred fifty (350) miles of pipe each year. The 350 miles of pipe mechanically cleaned under
21 this Paragraph may be included in the cleaning miles required in Section VII (Compliance
22 Actions) Paragraph C 2a.
23

24 b. The City shall utilize chemical root control to treat at least one
25 hundred fifty (150) miles of pipe each year. Mileage chemically-treated under this Paragraph
26
27
28

1 may be included in the cleaning miles required in Section VII (Compliance Actions) Paragraph
2 C 2a., if the chemical treatment is independent from the mechanical root cleaning miles counted
3 in Section VII (Compliance Actions) Paragraph C 3a.
4

5 c. By March 1st of each year, the City shall submit an annual report
6 pursuant to Section VII (Compliance Actions) Paragraph G of this Second Partial Consent
7 Decree, to EPA for review pursuant to Section VIII (Plan and Report Review and Approval)
8 documenting how many miles of pipe were subject to mechanical and chemical root control,
9 respectively, during the previous year. The report shall evaluate the success of the program,
10 distinguish between pipes in canyons and pipes located elsewhere and document any problem
11 pipe segments or lines that are referred to the Sewer Repair, Rehabilitation, and Replacement
12 Program in Paragraph C 5 below.
13

14
15 4. SEWER PIPE INSPECTION AND CONDITION ASSESSMENT

16 a. The City shall inspect each sewer pipe that experiences a blockage
17 leading to an SSO using CCTV or other appropriate inspection methods as soon as is practicable
18 but no later than two (2) weeks following the SSO. Lamping may not be used for purposes of
19 satisfying the obligations of this Paragraph 4.
20

21 b. Having completed CCTV inspection of one thousand two-hundred
22 (1,200) miles of its pipelines, including all but two miles of pipeline in all forty-two (42)
23 canyons, all pipe installed prior to 1965, all trunk sewers prior to 1991, and all high maintenance
24 sites by June 2004, the City shall complete CCTV inspection of at least forty (40) miles of its
25 pipelines each year, focusing on pipelines in high-maintenance areas and ensuring that all pipe
26
27
28

1 over forty (40) years old is inspected by CCTV. The calculation of the 40 miles requirement
2 may not include CCTV inspections done pursuant to Paragraph a. above or Section VII
3 (Compliance Actions) Paragraph C 1.
4

5 c. The City shall inspect all manholes in its collection system every
6 five (5) years, starting from September 13, 2005.

7 d. The City shall prepare condition assessment reports following
8 CCTV inspections that, at a minimum, document the following:

9 (i) defects that materially threaten the structural integrity of
10 the pipe or structure;

11 (ii) material defects that allow infiltration, inflow, or
12 exfiltration;

13 (iii) material pipe defects, including but not limited to, cracks,
14 holes, corrosion, misaligned joints, root intrusion, sags, improper lateral taps, or other defects
15 that make the pipe or structure prone to grease, root, or debris blockages;

16 (iv) a rank or score of the condition of each inspected pipe or
17 structure on a sliding scale that indicates the severity of any defects found;

18 (v) whether the pipe or structure requires either short or long-
19 term repair under Paragraph 5 below;

20 (vi) changes to cleaning frequency as a result of the assessment;

21 and

22 (vii) an estimate of the expected remaining life of the pipe or
23

1 structure.

2 e. By March 1st of each year, the City shall submit an annual report
3 pursuant to Section VII (Compliance Actions) Paragraph G of this Second Partial Consent
4 Decree, to EPA for review pursuant to Section VIII (Plan and Report Review and Approval)
5 summarizing the findings of the sewer pipe condition assessments conducted during the previous
6 calendar year, documenting any past changes in inspection methods, and differentiating between
7 inspections and condition assessments of pipes in canyons and pipes located elsewhere.
8

9
10 5. SEWER REPAIR, REHABILITATION, AND REPLACEMENT

11 a. The City shall repair all Acute Defects within one (1) year of
12 discovery of the defect. The City shall maintain a log listing all sewer line Acute Defects in
13 need of expeditious repair or replacement, the date the City discovered the Acute Defect, a
14 schedule for performing the repair or replacement, and the date of project completion.
15

16 b. Between January 1, 2002 and June 30, 2007, the City shall replace,
17 rehabilitate, or permanently repair two hundred (200) miles of pipeline. Permanent repair means
18 the correction of a structural defect in a manhole to manhole pipe segment such that the repaired
19 segment has the same life expectancy as a rehabilitated pipe segment. The City shall maintain a
20 log listing each sewer pipe and structure project completed during the previous year and the date
21 the project was completed.
22

23 c. The City shall maintain a rolling ten (10) year CIP.

24 d. By March 1st of each year, the City shall submit an annual report
25 pursuant to Section VII (Compliance Actions) Paragraph G, to EPA for review pursuant to
26
27
28

1 Section VIII (Plan and Report Review and Approval) which describes all Acute Defect and long-
2 term projects completed in the previous year pursuant to this Paragraph, distinguishes between
3 canyon and non-canyon projects, documents all projects referred to programs under other
4 Paragraphs of this Section, and includes copies of the Acute Defect logs for the previous year.
5 Upon request by EPA, the City shall provide EPA with a copy of its full CIP within thirty (30)
6 days. Nothing in this Paragraph 5 shall require the City to implement any of the projects listed
7 in the CIP not otherwise required hereunder.
8

9
10 6. FATS, OILS & GREASE (FOG) BLOCKAGE CONTROL PROGRAM

11 a. For at least the duration of this Second Partial Consent Decree, the
12 City shall implement a Residential Grease Outreach and Education Program consisting of the
13 following elements.

14 (i) The City shall distribute informational FOG postcards to all
15 residents living within a one thousand (1,000) foot radius of each residential grease SSO within
16 ten (10) working days of a SSO;

17 (ii) The City shall prepare and distribute FOG inserts with City
18 water/sewer bills semiannually;

19 (iii) The City shall produce residential grease Public Service
20 Announcements and broadcast them on the City's public access channel at least twice per week;

21 (iv) The City shall prepare and maintain grease education
22 information on the MWWD web site; and

23 (v) The City shall attend the annual Apartment and
24

1 Condominium Owner's Association convention to publicize its FOG program.

2 b. The City shall implement a program for timely enforcement and
3 inspection follow-up at Food Service Establishments ("FSE"). At a minimum, the City shall:
4

5 (i) inspect each FSE at least once every two (2) years.

6 Inspection of FSEs maintaining full compliance shall continue on a biannual frequency. Any
7 FSE found to be in violation shall be inspected at least every ninety (90) days until full
8 compliance is demonstrated for a minimum of two (2) ninety (90) day inspection cycles;
9

10 (ii) issue a formal Notice of Violation to an FSE within two (2)
11 weeks of discovering a violation;

12 (iii) hold administrative hearings within ninety (90) days of the
13 NOV if the FSE fails to comply with the NOV or has had two NOVs within the last year or for
14 the same compliance issue and, if non-compliance continues, hold a Permit Revocation hearing
15 within ninety (90) days of the administrative hearing and, if necessary, terminate water service if
16 the City is the water service provider;
17

18 (iv) issue compliance schedules, assess fees or penalties, and
19 revoke permits as necessary to ensure compliance;
20

21 (v) inspect each new and substantially remodeled FSE within
22 four (4) months of the FSE's start up; and

23 (vi) assure adequate budget and staffing to meet the above
24 requirements.
25

26 c. By March 1st of each year, the City shall submit an annual report
27
28

1 pursuant to Section VII (Compliance Actions) Paragraph G of this Second Partial Consent
2 Decree, to EPA for review pursuant to Section VIII (Plan and Report Review and Approval)
3 documenting the activities carried out under the FOG Blockage Control Program during the
4 previous year. The report shall: (i) include copies of the FSE inspection and enforcement log
5 for the previous year, and (ii) discuss budget and staffing levels for the previous and current
6 years.
7

8
9 7. CANYON AREA SSO ELIMINATION

10 a. By no later than March 1, 2009, the City shall complete the
11 Canyon Economic and Environmental Analyses for the forty-two (42) canyons listed below in
12 order to evaluate the feasibility and need to relocate the sewer lines out of canyon bottoms. The
13 economic and environmental analyses shall include both quantitative and qualitative costs and
14 benefits of alternatives, weigh environmental impacts, and address stakeholder and community
15 input. The analyses shall consider the life cycle costs of the alternatives. When estimating the
16 cost to maintain sewer facilities in canyons, the cost of the increased risk of an SSO occurring
17 and the cost of the impacts to the canyon habitat resulting from necessary canyon access and
18 maintenance, as required by Section VII (Compliance Actions) Paragraphs C 1, C 2, C 3, and C
19 7 will be considered. Where the life cycle cost of redirecting flow is less than thirty-five percent
20 (35%) more than the life cycle cost of leaving the flow in place, and where environmental and
21 community interest factors indicate that flow should be redirected in whole or in part, redirection
22 shall be undertaken. Those sewers identified for relocation shall be included in the next update
23 of the City's CIP. Nothing in Section VII (Compliance Actions) of this Second Partial Consent
24
25
26
27
28

1 Decree shall require the City to relocate any sewer.

2 b. The City shall conduct analyses for a minimum of six (6) canyons
3 a year, starting January 1, 2004, for the following canyons, giving priority to those canyons
4 containing pipeline identified as a priority under Section VII (Compliance Actions) Paragraph C
5

6 4.

7 Tecolote

8 East Tecolote (East Clairemont)

9 Stevenson

10 Van Nuys

11 San Clemente

12 Upper Rose

13 Middle Rose

14 Lower Rose

15 Dakota

16 Manning

17 Acuña

18 Park Mesa

19 Bounty & Waring

20 Mission Center Road

21 Lake Murray

22 Adobe Falls

- 1 · Mission Gorge (Junipero Serra)
- 2 · Chollas Creek
- 3 · Chocolate (Home Avenue)
- 4 ·
- 5 · Switzer
- 6 · Carroll (Rock Quarry)
- 7 · Alvarado
- 8 · Sorrento/Flintkote
- 9 ·
- 10 · Roselle/Sonico
- 11 · Lopez
- 12 · Peñasquitos
- 13 · Peñasquitos Bluffs
- 14 ·
- 15 · Rose Creek East of I-805
- 16 · Mesa College and I-805 (Onalaska)
- 17 · Black Mountain
- 18 · Shawn
- 19 ·
- 20 · Shepherd (Santo Road)
- 21 · Woodman
- 22 · Lexington
- 23 · Washington Creek
- 24 · Highway 163 Corridor
- 25 ·
- 26 · El Camino Real/San Dieguito Road

1 Florida

2 Sevan Court

3 Skylark

4 Rancho Mission

5 45th & Boston

6
7 If more than six (6) Canyon Economic and Environmental Analyses are completed in one
8 (1) year, the City may hold these analyses in reserve to be applied, if needed, against the
9 requirement to complete six (6) analyses per year in any future year.
10

11 c. The City shall implement the following minimum measures:

12 (i) The City shall conduct an annual visual exterior inspection
13 of each canyon area trunk sewer, including examination of each maintenance hole structure for
14 structural integrity, examination of any exposed sewer pipes, and observation of any condition in
15 the canyon area that could pose a threat to pipes or maintenance hole structures. The City shall
16 assess the environmental and other external physical factors that may lead to a structural failure.
17 Annual inspections shall include such factors as erosion, landslides, flooding, excessive plant
18 growth, and any circumstances that could affect pipe or maintenance hole structural integrity.
19

20 (ii) During each annual inspection of canyon trunk sewers
21 required by Subparagraph (i) above, the City shall identify all potentially vulnerable sections of
22 canyon pipelines.
23

24 (iii) The City shall visually inspect all potentially vulnerable
25 sections of canyon pipelines within one (1) week of every significant rainfall (over .5" within a
26

1 twenty-four (24) hour period).

2 (iv) The City shall conduct cleaning and annual maintenance of
3 each canyon area sewer pipe and maintenance hole structure, including, but not limited to,
4 control of erosion that may undermine sewer pipes or maintenance hole structures, diversion of
5 channels when necessary to protect the infrastructure, rebuilding of deteriorated maintenance
6 hole structures, and the securing of maintenance hole covers to prevent vandalism as specified in
7 Section VII (Compliance Actions) Paragraph C 9b.

8 (v) The City shall obtain short and long-term access to each
9 canyon area sewer pipe sufficient to allow for the cleaning and annual inspection of such pipes
10 as required by this Second Partial Consent Decree.

11 d. By March 1st of each year the City shall submit an annual report to
12 EPA for review pursuant to Section VII (Compliance Actions) Paragraph G of this Second
13 Partial Consent Decree, documenting which canyon sewers were cleaned and/or inspected during
14 the previous calendar year, listing all potentially vulnerable sections of canyon pipelines
15 identified in Subparagraph c.(ii) above, describing the plans the City intends to undertake for the
16 then current year, summarizing and including the sewer relocation economic and environmental
17 analyses completed in the previous calendar year, and listing those canyons for which economic
18 and environmental analyses will be done in the current year.

19 8. PUMP STATION AND FORCE MAIN SSO REDUCTION ACTION
20 PROGRAM

21 a. The City shall complete the following projects by the dates

1 specified below:

2 PUMP STATIONS WITH IMPROVEMENTS UNDER DESIGN AND CONSTRUCTION:

3

Pump Station No.	Construction Completion Date	Description of Work
77A	June 2006	Major mechanical & electrical upgrades (replace and upsize pumps and motors; replace flow meters; add A/C to VFD room, add alarms, automatic transfer switch, and all necessary new SCADA control systems); structural modification of facility

4
5
6
7
8

9 b. By March 1st of each year the City shall submit an annual report
10 pursuant to Section VII (Compliance Actions) Paragraph G of this Second Partial Consent
11 Decree, to EPA for review pursuant to Section VII (Plan and Report Review and Approval),
12 documenting the City's progress in the projects during the previous year.
13

14 9. PROGRAM TO ADDRESS OTHER CAUSES OF SSOS

15 a. Upon entry of this Second Partial Consent Decree, the City shall
16 require all Contractors working under a new construction contract to have an approved SSO
17 response plan prior to initiating work if the construction work is to occur within a public right-
18 of-way or sewer easement. All City construction contracts must contain provisions that allow
19 the City to impose penalties and/or cleanup costs on any Contractor whose activities, or failure to
20 act, result in an SSO or other violation of this Second Partial Consent Decree.
21
22

23 b. The City shall secure at least six hundred (600) manhole covers in
24 remote areas each year with all five thousand eight hundred (5,800) +/- covers to be secured
25 prior to termination of this Second Partial Consent Decree. If more than 600 manhole covers in
26
27
28

1 remote areas are secured in one (1) year, the City may hold these secured covers in reserve to be
2 applied, if needed, against the requirement to secure 600 manhole covers per year in any future
3 year.
4

5 c. The City shall conduct a Public Outreach Program to educate the
6 public about vandalism.

7 d. By March 1st of each year the City shall submit an annual report
8 pursuant to Section VII (Compliance Actions) Paragraph G of this Second Partial Consent
9 Decree, to EPA for review pursuant to Section VIII (Plan and Report Review and Approval),
10 documenting the activities carried out under this program, summarizing the SSOs caused by
11 Contractors or vandalism, and distinguishing between SSOs in canyon and non-canyon areas.
12

13 D. COLLECTION SYSTEM CAPACITY ASSESSMENT AND ASSURANCE
14

15 1. Capacity Assessment

16 a. The City shall continue to use the dynamic model developed as
17 required by the U.S.A. v. City of San Diego, Case No. 88-1101-B, Stipulated Final Order for
18 Injunctive Relief, to analyze the hydraulic capacity of all trunk sewers 15 inch in diameter or
19 greater. The City will ensure that system capacity is sufficient and will continue to collect flow
20 monitoring data in both dry and wet weather and perform a dynamic modeling analysis for all of
21 the City's trunk sewers. The City will add thirteen (13) new permanent flow meters on trunk
22 sewers fifteen (15) inches in diameter or greater by December 31, 2005, at an additional cost of
23 approximately \$1.3 million. Combining the existing and additional flow meters, the total
24 monitoring coverage in flow weighted length shall exceed ninety percent (90%). The data from
25
26
27
28

1 this additional metering will be incorporated into the criticality assessment for the trunk sewers.
2 The modeling analysis shall include trunk-by-trunk model calibrations based on dry weather
3 flow monitoring data and model simulations for the present, future (5-10 years), and wet weather
4 scenarios. By July 31, 2006, the City shall submit a Trunk Sewer Capacity Assessment Report
5 documenting the findings of the above mentioned modeling analysis. The report shall prioritize
6 the trunk sewers as either critical, semi-critical, or non-critical, according to the flow monitoring
7 and modeling results. The City shall update the Trunk Sewer Capacity Assessment Report on an
8 annual basis, considering new flow trends, changes in the sewer system, and other modifications.
9
10 The report and/or updates shall be provided to Plaintiffs annually.
11

12 b. THIS PARAGRAPH IS RESERVED FOR FUTURE USE.

13 2. Capacity Assurance Program
14

15 The City shall implement and complete the following capacity improvement
16 projects on the schedule below. These projects may be included in the mileage required in
17 Section VII (Sewer Repair, Rehabilitation, and Replacement) Paragraph C 5b.
18

19 TRUNK SEWERS

Trunk	Trunk Name	Construction Completion Date
43	Sorrento Valley	June 2007
40	Miramar	December 2007

23 As a result of the ongoing capacity assessment, the City shall describe any proposed
24 schedule or project changes/additions it seeks to make to this Paragraph with a justification and
25 seek EPA's approval under Section VIII (Plan and Report Review and Approval) Paragraphs A
26
27
28

1 and B of this Second Partial Consent Decree.

2
3 3. By March 1st of each year the City shall submit an annual report pursuant
4 to Section VII (Compliance Actions) Paragraph G of this Second Partial Consent Decree, to EPA
5 for review pursuant to Section VIII (Plan and Report Review and Approval), detailing at a
6 minimum, the upgrades made during the previous year and the effectiveness of those upgrades at
7 eliminating SSOs.

8
9 E. THIS PARAGRAPH IS RESERVED FOR FUTURE USE.

10 F. OTHER SSO REQUIREMENTS: The City shall substantially reduce the
11 frequency and volume of SSOs.

12
13 G. ANNUAL PROGRESS REPORT:

14 1. By March 1st of each year this Second Partial Consent Decree remains in
15 effect, the City shall submit an annual progress report to EPA, with copies to Baykeeper and
16 Surfrider. This report (or parts thereof) shall be reviewed and, where so provided, approved or
17 disapproved following the process in Section VIII (Plan and Report Review and Approval)
18 Paragraphs A - D of this Second Partial Consent Decree.

19
20 2. The report shall:

21 a. include the specific annual reporting requirements set forth in
22 Paragraphs B through D above;

23 b. provide other details relevant to the City's implementation of, and
24 compliance with, this Second Partial Consent Decree during the preceding year, including any
25
26
27
28

1 program modifications during the prior calendar year;

2 c. assess the City's progress towards meeting the requirements of this
3 Second Partial Consent Decree program-by-program and overall;

4 d. report the volume, number, and location of SSBs;

5 e. report the volume, number, and location of SSOs, with the
6 exception of SSBs reported under Subparagraph d. above, and compare the volume, number, and
7 location of the SSOs reported under this Subparagraph to SSOs occurring since 1997; and

8 f. propose new or modified plans in any area where the City has
9 materially failed to comply with the requirements of this Second Partial Consent Decree. The
10 plan shall identify the material impact of the proposed changes on other obligations in this
11 Section VII (Compliance Actions) of this Second Partial Consent Decree. Nothing in this
12 Paragraph shall require the City to perform any work not otherwise required in Section VII
13 (Compliance Actions).

14 3. THIS PARAGRAPH IS RESERVED FOR FUTURE USE.

15 H. QUARTERLY SSO REPORTS

16 On the first day of February, May, August, and November in each calendar year
17 in which activities are conducted pursuant to this Second Partial Consent Decree, the City shall
18 submit a summary of all SSOs occurring during the previous calendar quarter to EPA, with
19 copies to Baykeeper and Surfrider, along with the primary factors contributing to the SSOs if
20 known. The reports shall:

1. indicate which SSOs occurred in canyons;
2. indicate whether SSOs entered waters of the United States and, if so, whether they entered via storm drains or other man-made conveyances; and
3. differentiate between SSBs and all other SSOs.

I. OTHER REPORTS

Upon the request of a Plaintiff, the City shall provide any information required by this Second Partial Consent Decree or relevant to implementation or compliance with any provision of this Second Partial Consent Decree.

J. PACIFIC BEACH POINT STUDY

By June 30, 2006, the City will complete a study of Pacific Beach Point to:

1. seek to identify the sources, if any, of bacteriological contamination; and
2. develop recommendations to remedy the sources identified, if any. This study shall not exceed a cost of \$250,000, and the final report shall be furnished to Baykeeper, Surfrider, and EPA. Nothing contained in this section shall require the City to perform any work or remediation recommended in said study.

VIII. PLAN AND REPORT REVIEW AND APPROVAL

A. The submittal of any plan or report required by this Second Partial Consent Decree shall be subject to EPA's review and/or approval as specified in Section VII (Compliance Actions) and Paragraphs B - D below. Copies of all such plans and reports and follow-up correspondence shall be provided simultaneously to Citizen Plaintiffs. The City shall respond to

1 reasonable requests for additional documentation by Citizen Plaintiffs.

2 B. For new or modified plans submitted under Section VII (Compliance Actions)

3 Paragraph G 2f.:

4 1. EPA shall:

- 5 a. approve the submission or request in whole or in part;
- 6 b. approve the submission or request with specified conditions;
- 7 c. modify the submission or request to cure any deficiency;
- 8 d. disapprove the submission or request in whole or in part, directing
- 9 the City to correct any deficiency; or
- 10 e. any combination of the above.

11 2. Citizen Plaintiffs shall submit any written comments to EPA and the City

12 within thirty (30) days of the City's submission.

13 3. EPA shall use its best efforts to take the actions in Paragraph 1 above

14 within ninety (90) days of receipt of the City's submission. If EPA does not take action by the

15 end of the ninety (90) days, the City's submission shall be deemed disapproved.

16 4. The City shall revise the plan or report to correct any deficiency identified

17 by EPA within sixty (60) days of receipt of EPA's action, unless the time is extended by mutual

18 agreement of EPA and the City.

19 5. In the event that a revised submission is disapproved in whole or in part,

20 EPA may again require the City to correct the deficiencies. The City shall take the action

1 specified by EPA within sixty (60) days, subject only to its right to invoke dispute resolution
2 under Section IX (Dispute Resolution) of this Second Partial Consent Decree. The sixty (60)
3 days may be extended by mutual agreement of the EPA and the City up to an additional sixty
4 (60) days. Nothing in this Paragraph shall require the City to perform any work not otherwise
5 required by Section VII (Compliance Actions).
6

7 6. Within thirty (30) days, Citizen Plaintiffs may challenge an EPA action
8 approving a major modification of the activities required in Section VII (Compliance Actions)
9 by invoking Dispute Resolution under Section IX (Dispute Resolution) of this Second Partial
10 Consent Decree. The thirty (30) days may be extended by mutual agreement of the Parties.
11

12 C. For reports requiring EPA review but not approval, EPA shall use its best efforts
13 to complete its review within one hundred twenty (120) days of receipt of the City's submission.
14 If, upon review, EPA determines that the City is failing to comply with Section VII (Compliance
15 Actions) Paragraphs B - D of this Second Partial Consent Decree, EPA shall notify the City to
16 submit a plan to address the deficiencies, following the process described in Paragraph B above.
17 Nothing in this Paragraph shall require the City to perform any work not otherwise required in
18 Section VII (Compliance Actions).
19
20

21 D. THIS PARAGRAPH IS RESERVED FOR FUTURE USE.

22 E. Upon EPA's approval of the submissions, any changes that supercede existing
23 requirements in Section VII (Compliance Actions) Paragraphs B - D of this Second Partial
24 Consent Decree shall be incorporated by reference as enforceable parts of this Second Partial
25 Consent Decree.
26
27
28

1 **IX. DISPUTE RESOLUTION**

2 A. Unless otherwise expressly provided for in this Second Partial Consent Decree,
3 the dispute resolution procedures of this Section shall be the exclusive mechanism to resolve
4 disputes arising under or with respect to this Second Partial Consent Decree. However, the
5 procedures set forth in this Section shall not apply to:
6

7 1. actions by the United States to enforce obligations of the City that have
8 not been disputed in accordance with this Section; or
9

10 2. any disputes concerning the issuance, modification, revocation, or
11 reissuance of NPDES permits.

12 3. THIS PARAGRAPH IS RESERVED FOR FUTURE USE.
13

14 B. A dispute shall be considered to have arisen when one (1) party sends the other
15 party a written Notice of Dispute. As used in this Paragraph, parties shall refer to the Chief,
16 CWA Compliance Office, Water Division, EPA Region 9, for the United States, the Director of
17 the Metropolitan Wastewater Department for the City, and the attorneys for Citizen Plaintiffs.
18 Any dispute that arises under or with respect to this Second Partial Consent Decree shall in the
19 first instance be the subject of informal negotiations between the parties to the dispute. During
20 the informal negotiations the EPA shall identify the reasons for the non-approval. The period for
21 informal negotiations shall not exceed thirty (30) days from the time the dispute arises, unless it
22 is modified by written agreement of the parties.
23

24 C. 1. In the event that the Parties cannot resolve a dispute by informal
25 negotiations under the preceding Paragraph B, the City or Citizen Plaintiffs may invoke formal
26
27

1 dispute resolution procedures by providing the Director with a written statement of position on
2 the matter in dispute, including, but not limited to, any factual data, analysis or opinion
3 supporting that position and any supporting documentation relied upon by the City or Citizen
4 Plaintiffs. Such statement of position shall be provided within thirty (30) days of the end of
5 informal negotiations. If the City or Citizen Plaintiffs do not invoke formal dispute resolution
6 within thirty (30) days, EPA's position shall be binding on the City and Citizen Plaintiffs.
7

8 2. Within thirty (30) days after receipt of a City's or Citizen Plaintiffs'
9 statement of position, the Director shall provide a written Response to the City's or Citizen
10 Plaintiffs' statement of position, including, but not limited to, any factual data, analysis, or
11 opinion supporting that position and all supporting documentation relied upon by EPA. That
12 position shall be considered binding and the City and Citizen Plaintiffs shall waive any right to
13 challenge that position unless, within thirty (30) days after receipt of the Director's decision, the
14 City or Citizen Plaintiffs file and serve upon the United States a motion for judicial review of the
15 decision. The motion shall include a description of the matter in dispute, the efforts made by the
16 Parties to resolve it, the relief requested, and the schedule, if any, within which the dispute must
17 be resolved to ensure orderly implementation of this Second Partial Consent Decree. The
18 schedules contained in the local rules for the United States District Court shall apply to the
19 dispute; provided, however, the United States shall have at least thirty (30) days to file a
20 response with an alternative proposal for resolution.
21
22
23

24 3. In proceedings on any dispute governed by this Section, the moving party
25 shall have the burden by a preponderance of the evidence to prevail in the dispute regarding
26
27
28

1 EPA's decision; provided, however, the City shall be considered the moving party with respect
2 to Section VII (Compliance Actions); Section VIII (Plan and Report Review and Approval);
3 Section XI (Stipulated Penalties); and Section XXIV (Termination).
4

5 D. The invocation of formal dispute resolution procedures under this Section shall
6 not extend, postpone, or affect in any way any obligation of the City under this Second Partial
7 Consent Decree, not directly in dispute unless and until final resolution of the dispute so
8 provides. Stipulated penalties with respect to the disputed matter shall continue to accrue;
9 provided, however, that the City may argue to the Court that stipulated penalties should not run
10 after the matter has been fully briefed and submitted to the Court and provided that Plaintiffs
11 may argue the contrary. Payment shall be stayed pending resolution of the dispute. Except as
12 provided above, stipulated penalties shall accrue from the first day of non-compliance with any
13 applicable provision of this Second Partial Consent Decree. In the event that the City does not
14 prevail on the disputed issue, stipulated penalties may be assessed as provided in Section XI
15 (Stipulated Penalties) of this Second Partial Consent Decree.
16
17

18 E. Citizen Plaintiffs have the right to invoke Dispute Resolution pursuant to this
19 Section IX (Dispute Resolution) in the following circumstances:
20

21 1. Citizen Plaintiffs may challenge an EPA action approving a major
22 modification of the activities required in Section VII (Compliance Actions). The Citizen
23 Plaintiffs retain the right to dispute what constitutes a major modification. For purposes of
24 establishing what constitutes a major modification under this Subparagraph, Citizen Plaintiffs
25 shall have the burden of establishing the same based upon the arbitrary and capricious standard
26
27
28

1 of proof.

2 2. Citizen Plaintiffs may challenge an EPA action terminating the Second
3 Partial Consent Decree pursuant to Section XXIV (Termination).
4

5 3. With respect to any motion under this Section, the Citizen Plaintiffs shall
6 be considered the moving party.
7

8 **X. FORCE MAJEURE**

9 A. “Force majeure,” for purposes of this Second Partial Consent Decree, is defined
10 as any event arising from causes beyond the control of the City, of any entity controlled by the
11 City, or of the Contractors, that delays or prevents the performance of any obligation under this
12 Second Partial Consent Decree, despite the City’s best efforts to fulfill the obligation. The
13 requirement that the City exercise “best efforts to fulfill the obligation” includes using
14 reasonable efforts to anticipate any potential force majeure event and best efforts to address the
15 effects of any potential force majeure event as it is occurring and following the potential force
16 majeure event, such that the delay is minimized to the greatest extent possible. “Force Majeure”
17 shall not, in any event, include unanticipated or increased costs associated with implementation
18 of this Second Partial Consent Decree, changed financial circumstances, or other financial or
19 budgetary issues.
20
21

22 B. If any event occurs or has occurred that may delay the completion of any
23 requirement of this Second Partial Consent Decree, whether or not caused by a force majeure
24 event, the City shall notify EPA in writing, with copies to Baykeeper and Surfrider, within thirty
25 (30) days of when the City first knew, or in the exercise of reasonable diligence under the
26
27
28

1 circumstances, should have known of such event. The notice shall indicate whether the City
2 claims that the delay should be excused as a force majeure event. The notice shall describe in
3 detail the basis for the City's contention that it experienced a force majeure delay; the anticipated
4 duration of the delay; the precise cause or causes of the delay; all actions taken or to be taken to
5 prevent or minimize the delay; and a schedule for implementation of any measures to be taken to
6 prevent or mitigate the delay or the effect of the delay. The City shall adopt all reasonable
7 measures to avoid and minimize such delays. Failure to comply with the above requirements
8 shall preclude the City from asserting any claim of force majeure. The City shall be deemed to
9 know of any circumstance of which the City, any entity controlled by the City, or the Contractors
10 knew or should have known.

11 C. If EPA agrees that the delay or anticipated delay is attributable to a force majeure
12 event, the time for performance of the obligations under this Second Partial Consent Decree that
13 are affected by the force majeure event will be extended by EPA in writing for such time as is
14 necessary to complete those obligations and stipulated penalties shall not be due for such period.
15 If EPA does not agree that the delay or anticipated delay has been or will be caused by a force
16 majeure event, EPA will notify the City in writing of its decision. If the City elects to invoke the
17 Dispute Resolution procedures set forth in Section IX (Dispute Resolution) of this Second Partial
18 Consent Decree, it shall do so no later than thirty (30) days after receipt of EPA's notice. In any
19 such proceeding, the City shall have the burden of demonstrating by a preponderance of the
20 evidence that the delay or anticipated delay has been or will be caused by a force majeure event,
21 and that the duration of the delay or the extension sought was or will be warranted under the
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

1 circumstances. Copies of all documents under this Subparagraph shall be provided to Baykeeper
2 and Surfrider.

3
4 D. An extension of the time for performance of the obligations the City contends are
5 affected by the force majeure event shall not, of itself, extend the time for performance of any
6 other obligation. The City must make an individual showing of proof regarding each delayed
7 incremental step or other requirement for which an extension is sought.

8
9 **XI. STIPULATED PENALTIES**

10 A. The City shall pay the stipulated penalties listed below upon written demand by
11 the United States. Pursuant to its non-reviewable enforcement discretion, the United States may
12 waive or reduce stipulated penalties. EPA need not provide a Notice of Violation prior to
13 assessing stipulated penalties. A copy of the demand shall be provided to Baykeeper and
14 Surfrider.
15

16 B. **COMPLIANCE MILESTONES**

17 The City shall pay stipulated penalties for each failure to implement, achieve, or
18 complete a requirement identified in Section VII (Compliance Actions) Paragraphs B - D of this
19 Second Partial Consent Decree as follows:
20

<u>Period of Noncompliance</u>	<u>Penalty per Milestone Date per Day of Violation</u>
Days 1 - 14	\$750
Days 15 - 28	\$1,500
Days over 28	\$3,000

1 C. REPORTING AND PLAN SUBMISSION

2 The City shall pay the stipulated penalties below for each day it fails to submit or
3
4 revise a report or plan required by this Second Partial Consent Decree.

<u>Period of Noncompliance</u>	<u>Penalty per Report/Plan per day of Violation</u>
Days 1 - 14	\$375
Days 15 - 28	\$750
Days over 28	\$1,500

10 D. SANITARY SEWER OVERFLOWS

11
12 1. Except as provided in Paragraph E below, the stipulated penalties set forth
13 in this Paragraph apply to any SSO over one thousand (1,000) gallons if any portion of that spill
14 reaches navigable waters. The stipulated penalties set forth in this Paragraph apply to those
15 SSOs that occur after the entry of the Second Partial Consent Decree. Gallons refer to the total
16 size of the overflow, spill, or release. Successive SSOs refer to the same part or reach of sewer
17 line (from manhole to manhole or from manhole to pump station), the same manhole, or the
18 same pump station under similar circumstances. The City shall provide notice of the SSO to
19 EPA:
20

- 21
22 a. when required by law to be reported to the Board and/or EPA; and
23 b. when required by the reports under Section VII (Compliance
24 Actions) of this Second Partial Consent Decree.

25 2. EPA may assess penalties as provided below:
26
27
28

1 a. Over one thousand (1000) and up to ten thousand (10,000) gallons

2 (i) First successive SSO \$ 2,000

3 (i) Second successive SSO \$ 5,000

4 (iii) Third successive SSO \$ 7,500

5 (iv) Fourth and subsequent
6 successive SSOs \$10,000

7 b. More than 10,000 gallons

8 (i) First successive SSO \$ 4,000

9 (ii) Second successive SSO \$10,000

10 (iii) Third successive SSO \$15,000

11 (iv) Fourth and subsequent
12 successive SSOs \$20,000

13 If the City does not reasonably estimate the size of a SSO, the SSO will be presumed to
14 be more than ten thousand (10,000) gallons for the purpose of determining stipulated penalties.

15 E. OTHER PROVISIONS:

16 1. The City shall not be liable for stipulated penalties under Paragraph D
17 above if the City demonstrates that it is in compliance with both the response and reporting
18 requirements in Section VII (Compliance Actions) Paragraphs B 1 - 4, and Paragraphs C 1b.; C
19 2a.; C 3a.-b.; C 4a.-d., C 5a.-b.; C 6b. (i-v); C 7a.; C 7c.(i-iv); C 8a.; C 9b.; and D 2.

20 2. The City shall not be liable for stipulated penalties under Paragraph D

1 above if the City demonstrates that the SSO was caused by an Act of God, vandalism, a non-City
2 Contractor, or any act of a third party not working directly or indirectly on behalf of the City.
3

4 3. The City shall not be liable for stipulated penalties under Paragraph D
5 above for any SSO downstream of the Marine Corps Air Station Miramar that was caused by the
6 Marine Corps Air Station Miramar; provided however, this exception applies only if the City
7 utilizes best efforts to reach an agreement with Marine Corps Air Station Miramar to address the
8 potential for SSOs.
9

10 4. Payment of stipulated penalties as provided in this Section shall be in
11 addition to any other rights or remedies, including statutory penalties, which may be available to
12 the United States by reason of the City's failure to comply with this Second Partial Consent
13 Decree and all applicable federal, state, or local laws, regulations, wastewater discharge permits,
14 and all other applicable permits.
15

16 5. The United States will credit the City for any stipulated penalty paid with
17 respect to any SSO pursuant to this Second Partial Consent Decree in any future enforcement
18 action in which EPA seeks penalties for that SSO. The United States will credit the City against
19 any stipulated penalty assessed pursuant to this Second Partial Consent Decree with respect to
20 any EPA enforcement action in which penalties were paid for that SSO.
21

22 6. In exercising its discretion of whether to assess a stipulated penalty for an
23 SSO, the United States will consider the amount of sewage recovered.
24

25 7. In exercising its discretion of whether to assess a stipulated penalty for an
26 SSO, the United States will consider the length of time after which a disputed issue has been
27

1 fully briefed and is under the consideration of the United States District Court pursuant to
2 Section IX (Dispute Resolution) of this Second Partial Consent Decree.
3

4 8. SSBs shall not be subject to stipulated penalties under this Second Partial
5 Consent Decree.

6 **XII. PAYMENTS**

7 The City shall pay stipulated penalties owing to the United States by certified or cashier's
8 check in the amount payable to the "United States Department of Justice" referencing "DOJ No.
9 90-5-1-1-4364/1" and United States Attorney's file number (to be provided), and delivered to the
10 office of the United States Attorney, Southern District of California, 880 Front Street, Room
11 6293, San Diego, California, 92101. In the event that any payments are not received when due,
12 interest shall continue to accrue on the unpaid balance through the date of payment at the rate
13 established by the Secretary of the Treasury, pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1961.
14

15 **XIII. RIGHT OF ENTRY**

16 A. EPA, their employees, and authorized agents (including contractors and
17 subcontractors) upon presentation of valid credentials or other official authorization, shall have
18 access to enter the City's publicly-owned treatment works for the purposes of monitoring,
19 investigating, and/or verifying the City's compliance with all terms of this Second Partial
20 Consent Decree. Where appropriate, EPA shall provide reasonable notice to the City.
21

22 B. Nothing in this Section shall be construed to limit the right of the United States to
23 enter the City's property, to require monitoring, or to obtain information pursuant to federal or
24 state law or regulation.
25
26
27
28

- 1
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5
- 6
- 7
- 8
- 9
- 10
- 11
- 12
- 13
- 14
- 15
- 16
- 17
- 18
- 19
- 20
- 21
- 22
- 23
- 24
- 25
- 26
- 27
- 28

A. This Second Partial Consent Decree does not relieve the City of any obligation to apply for, obtain and comply with the requirements of any new or existing NPDES permit or its duty to comply with the CWA and any other applicable federal and state laws, regulations, and permits.

XV. ONGOING COMPLIANCE RESPONSIBILITIES

B. The United States, by its consent to the entry of this Second Partial Consent Decree, does not warrant or aver in any manner that the City's compliance with this Second Partial Consent Decree will result in compliance with the provisions of the CWA or with any NPDES permit.

XVI. EFFECT OF SETTLEMENT

A. This Second Partial Consent Decree resolves claims for civil penalties for spills occurring on or before October 1, 2004, unless any one of the following events occur:

XVI. EFFECT OF SETTLEMENT

- 42 -

1 1. The Final Consent Decree is not lodged with the United States District
2 Court by June 30, 2007; or

3 2. The District Court does not enter or declines to enter the Final Consent
4 Decree; or

5 3. The District Court lifts the stay of litigation in the instant case or
6 otherwise allows litigation to proceed; or

7 4. The City responds to the United States' Complaint in the instant litigation.

8 This Second Partial Consent Decree does not limit or resolve any civil claims relating to
9 the United States' ability to seek injunctive relief.

10 B. This Second Partial Consent Decree does not limit or affect the rights of
11 Defendant or of the United States against any third parties, not party to this Second Partial
12 Consent Decree, nor does it limit the rights of third parties, not parties to this Second Partial
13 Consent Decree, against the City, except as otherwise provided by law. This Second Partial
14 Consent Decree shall not be construed to create rights in, or grant any cause of action to, any
15 third parties not parties to this Second Partial Consent Decree.

16 C. The United States reserves all legal and equitable remedies available to enforce
17 the provisions of this Second Partial Consent Decree, except as expressly stated herein. This
18 Second Partial Consent Decree shall not be construed to limit the rights of the United States to
19 obtain penalties or injunctive relief under the Act or the implementing regulations, or under other
20 federal laws, regulations or permit conditions, except as expressly specified in Subparagraph A
21 of this Section XVI (Effect of Settlement). The United States further reserves all legal and
22

1 equitable remedies, including but not limited to injunctive relief, to address any imminent and
2 substantial endangerment to the public health or welfare or the environment. The United States
3 reserves the right to raise and the City reserves the right to contest the factual circumstances of
4 past spills and the City's past and future operations relating to the Collection System in any
5 future enforcement action for violations not addressed in this Second Partial Consent Decree.
6

7 D. This Second Partial Consent Decree shall be considered "diligent prosecution" for
8 purposes of Section 1319(G)(6) of the CWA.
9

10 **XVII. RESERVATION BY BAYKEEPER AND SURFRIDER**

11 Baykeeper and Surfrider may submit comments to EPA regarding the City's annual
12 report or the City's request for a major modification to this Second Partial Consent Decree.
13 Comments must be submitted within thirty (30) days of EPA's receipt of the City's annual report
14 or the City's request for a major modification of the Partial Consent Decree.
15

16 **XVIII. NO ADMISSION OF LIABILITY**

17 Neither the execution of this Second Partial Consent Decree nor any action taken
18 hereunder is an admission of any fact, liability, or wrongdoing of any kind regarding any of the
19 matters addressed in the Second Partial Consent Decree.
20

21 **XIX. CERTIFICATION OF SUBMISSIONS/RECORD RETENTION**

22 A. Any notice, report, certification, data presentation, or other document submitted
23 by the City pursuant to this Second Partial Consent Decree, which discusses, describes,
24 demonstrates, or supports any finding or makes any representation concerning the City's
25 compliance or non-compliance with any requirement(s) of this Second Partial Consent Decree,
26
27
28

1 shall contain the following certification by the City, signed by a responsible City official:

2 "I certify under penalty of law that this document and all attachments were
3 prepared under my direction or supervision in accordance with a system
4 designed to assure that qualified personnel properly gather and evaluate
5 the information submitted, based on my inquiry of the person or persons
6 who manage the system, or those persons directly responsible for
7 gathering the information, the information submitted is, to the best of my
8 knowledge and belief, true, accurate, and complete. I am aware that there
9 are significant penalties for submitting false information, including the
10 possibility of fine and imprisonment for knowing violations."

11 _____
12 Signature

13 Title

14 B. The notice and reporting requirements contained in this Second Partial Consent
15 Decree do not relieve the City of its obligations to submit any other reports or information
16 required by applicable law. Notice of a violation does not excuse the violation. Any
17 information provided under the reporting requirements of this Second Partial Consent Decree
18 may be admissible evidence in any proceeding to enforce the provisions of this Second Partial
19 Consent Decree or the applicable law.

20 **XX. FORM OF NOTICE**

21 A. Unless otherwise specified, or as may be changed from time to time, all reports,
22 notices, or any other written communications required to be submitted under this Second Partial
23 Consent Decree shall be sent to the respective Parties at the following addresses:

24 As to the City:

25 City Attorney

26 City of San Diego

27 1200 Third Avenue, Suite 1100

28 San Diego, California 92101

1 As to Surfrider and Baykeeper:

2 Executive Director
3 Surfrider Foundation
4 P.O. Box 6010
5 San Clemente, California 92674-6010

6 Surfrider Foundation
7 San Diego County Chapter
8 P.O. Box 1511
9 Solana Beach, California 92075

10 San Diego Baykeeper
11 2924 Emerson Street, Suite 220
12 San Diego, California 92106

13 Marco A. Gonzalez
14 Rory Wicks
15 Coast Law Group LLP
16 169 Saxony Road, Suite 204
17 Encinitas, California 92024

18 Daniel Cooper
19 Lawyers for Clean Water
20 1004 A O'Reilly Street
21 San Francisco, California 94129

22 As to the United States

23 Section Chief
24 Environmental Enforcement Section
25 Environment & Natural Resources Division
26 United States Department of Justice
27 P.O. Box 7611
28 Washington, D.C. 20044-7611

1 Gail Cooper, RC-2
2 Air, Toxics, Water, and General Law Group
3 Office of Regional Counsel
4 U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
5 75 Hawthorne Street
6 San Francisco, California 94105

7 Jo Ann Cola, WTR-7
8 Water Management Division
9 U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
10 75 Hawthorne Street
11 San Francisco, California 94105

12 B. Notifications of communications shall be deemed submitted on the date they are
13 postmarked and sent by certified mail, return receipt requested, or deposited with an overnight
14 mail/delivery service.

15 XXI. COSTS OF SUIT/COMPLIANCE MONITORING

16 A. The City will pay Baykeeper and Surfrider up to \$10,000 for compliance
17 oversight. Payment under this Section shall be made within thirty (30) days of receipt of a
18 properly documented invoice showing the nature of the oversight, time expended, and the charge
19 per hour. Such payments shall not exceed the total listed herein during the period of this Second
20 Partial Consent Decree.

21 B. In the event Baykeeper or Surfrider prevail in demonstrating that the City is not in
22 compliance with the Second Partial Consent Decree, Baykeeper or Surfrider may be entitled to
23 recover fees consistent with Section 1365 of the CWA.

24 C. Upon execution of a Final Consent Decree, Baykeeper and Surfrider may be
25 eligible for reasonable attorneys' fees.
26

1 D. Within thirty (30) days of entry of this Second Partial Consent Decree, the City
2 shall pay Baykeeper and Surfrider \$309,923.44 as an advanced payment of the total attorneys'
3 fees and costs for which Baykeeper and Surfrider may be eligible. This payment is in addition to
4 the \$110,000 payment paid to Baykeeper and Surfrider under the previous Partial Consent
5 Decree. Any payment by the City of San Diego herein shall be a credit toward any subsequent
6 award or agreement on fees and costs.
7

8 **XXII. MODIFICATION**

9
10 This Second Partial Consent Decree contains the entire agreement of the Parties.

11 A. Any material modification to this Second Partial Consent Decree must be with the
12 written agreement of the Parties and approval by the Court, except as provided herein.

13 B. Notwithstanding Paragraph A above, EPA and the City can agree in writing and
14 without Court approval to make non-material modifications to the requirements of this Second
15 Partial Consent Decree. Baykeeper and Surfrider shall receive copies of any such modifications.
16

17 C. Notwithstanding any provision of this Second Partial Consent Decree, the City
18 may seek modification of this Second Partial Consent Decree pursuant to Rule 60(b) of the
19 Federal Rules of Civil Procedure.
20

21 **XXIII. CONTINUING JURISDICTION OF THE COURT**

22 The Court shall retain jurisdiction to enforce the terms and conditions of this Second
23 Partial Consent Decree and to resolve disputes that may arise under this Second Partial Consent
24 Decree to the extent that this Second Partial Consent Decree provides for resolution of disputes
25 by the Court.
26
27
28

1 **XXIV. TERMINATION**

2 A. This Second Partial Consent Decree shall terminate on June 30, 2007, provided
3 that the City has certified to EPA with appropriate documentation that the City has complied
4 with all of its obligations under this Second Partial Consent Decree and paid any penalties, fees
5 and interest due under Section XI (Stipulated Penalties). To the extent this Second Partial
6 Consent Decree includes a task or requirement that extends beyond June 30, 2007, that task or
7 requirement shall be prorated or apportioned on a monthly basis.

8
9 B. THIS PARAGRAPH IS RESERVED FOR FUTURE USE.

10
11 C. THIS PARAGRAPH IS RESERVED FOR FUTURE USE.

12 D. The Second Partial Consent Decree shall not terminate: 1) if the City has not
13 filed the certification described in Paragraph A, or 2) if EPA, Baykeeper or Surfrider object in
14 writing to the City's certification within three (3) months of the City's certification. Such
15 objections shall set forth the specific components of the certification alleged not to be complete.
16 If any party objects in writing to the City's certification, such dispute shall be resolved pursuant
17 to Section IX (Dispute Resolution). This Second Partial Consent Decree shall remain in effect
18 pending resolution of the dispute, provided however, the City shall not be obligated to perform
19 any obligation not expressly contested pursuant to this Paragraph.
20

21 **XXV. SIGNATORIES**

22
23 A. The signatories for the Parties certify that they are fully authorized to enter into
24 the terms and conditions of this Second Partial Consent Decree and to execute and legally bind
25 such Parties to this document.

26 B. The Parties shall identify on the attached signature pages the name, address,
27
28

1 telephone number, and fax number of one (1) agent who is authorized to accept service by mail
2 on the Party's behalf with respect to all matters arising under or related to this Second Partial
3 Consent Decree.
4

5 **XXVI. COUNTERPARTS**

6 This Second Partial Consent Decree may be executed in any number of counterpart
7 originals, each of which shall be deemed to constitute an original agreement, and all of which
8 shall constitute one (1) agreement. The execution of one counterpart by any party shall have the
9 same force and effect as if that party had signed all other counterparts.
10

11 **XXVII. PUBLIC COMMENT**

12 The United States consents to the entry of this Second Partial Consent Decree subject to
13 the publication of notice of this Second Partial Consent Decree pursuant to 28 C.F.R. 50.7. The
14 United States reserve its rights to withdraw or withhold consent to this Second Partial Consent
15 Decree if public comments disclose facts or considerations indicating this Second Partial
16 Consent Decree is inappropriate, improper, or inadequate. The City agrees to entry of this
17 Second Partial Consent Decree without further notice.
18
19
20

21 IT IS SO ORDERED this ____ day of _____, 2006.
22
23

24 _____
25 HON. RUDI M. BREWSTER
26 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT JUDGE
27 SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
28

1 THE UNDERSIGNED PARTY enters into this Second Partial Consent Decree in the matter of
2 United States, et al. v. City of San Diego.

3
4 FOR THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA:

5
6
7
8
9 _____
10 SUE ELLEN WOOLDRIDGE
11 Assistant Attorney General
12 Environment and Natural Resources
13 Division
14 United States Department of Justice
15 Washington, DC 20530

8/9/86

Dated

16
17 _____
18 BRADLEY O'BRIEN
19 Environmental Enforcement Section
20 Environment and Natural Resources
21 Division
22 United States Department of Justice
23 301 Howard Street, Suite 1050
24 San Francisco, California 94105

Dated

1 THE UNDERSIGNED PARTY enters into this Second Partial Consent Decree in the matter of
2 United States, et al. v. City of San Diego.

3
4 FOR THE ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY:

5
6
7
8
9 WAYNE NASTRI
10 Regional Administrator
11 U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
12 Region IX
13 75 Hawthorne Street
14 San Francisco, California 94105

26 JULY 2006
Dated

15
16 GRANTA NAKAYAMA
17 Assistant Administrator
18 for Enforcement & Compliance Assurance
19 U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
20 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
21 Washington, DC 20460-0001

8/10/06
Dated

22
23 GAIL COOPER
24 Office of Regional Counsel
25 U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
26 Region IX
27 75 Hawthorne Street
28 San Francisco, California 94105

7/24/06
Dated

1 THE UNDERSIGNED PARTY enters into this Second Partial Consent Decree in the matter of
2 United States, et al. v. City of San Diego.

3
4 FOR SAN DIEGO BAYKEEPER:

5
6
7
8
9 _____
10 BRUCE REZNIK

11 Executive Director

12 San Diego Coastkeeper (formerly San Diego Baykeeper)

7/10/06
Dated

13
14
15 _____
16 MARCO GONZALEZ

17 Coast Law Group LLP

18 169 Saxony Road, Suite 204

19 Encinitas, CA 92024

Dated

1 THE UNDERSIGNED PARTY enters into this Second Partial Consent Decree in the matter of
2 United States, et al. v. City of San Diego.

3
4 FOR SURFRIDER FOUNDATION:

5
6
7
8
9 Michelle C. Kremer
10 Chief Operating Officer
11 Surfrider Foundation
12
13
14

7/12/06
Dated

15
16 RORY H. WICKS
17 Coast Law Group LLP
18 169 Saxony Road, Suite 201
19 Encinitas, CA 92024
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

07/12/2006
Dated

1 THE UNDERSIGNED PARTY enters into this Second Partial Consent Decree in the matter of
2 United States, et al. v. City of San Diego.

3
4 FOR THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO:

5
6
7
8
9 RICHARD HAAS
10 Deputy Chief of Public Works
11 202 C Street
12 San Diego, California 92101

7/6/06
Dated

13
14 THOMAS C. ZELENY
15 Deputy City Attorney
16 Office of the San Diego City Attorney
17 1200 3rd Avenue, Suite 1100
18 San Diego, California 92101

7/6/06
Dated